

Supplementary Appendix for:
Generalizability of Heterogeneous Treatment Effect
Estimates Across Samples

Alexander Coppock, Thomas J. Leeper, Kevin J. Mullinix*

Forthcoming in the *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*
November 3, 2018

In this appendix, we provide the conditional average treatment effect estimate (CATE) by covariate class, experiment, and sample. In essence, these tables constitute the raw data from which our summaries are calculated.

In each table, the CATE column refers to the difference-in-means estimate of the treatment effect, conditional on membership in the covariate class. The SE column refers to the Neyman standard error, equivalent to HC2 robust standard errors. All p -values are two-sided and are not corrected for multiple comparisons. The Prop column describes what proportion of the subjects in a given experiment belong to the associated covariate class.

Readers should note that our analytical strategy, group comparisons, and dependent variables may or may not be the ones employed in the publications by the TESS Principal Investigators who designed the studies. That is, we take a uniform analytical approach to all of the studies; we do not attempt to directly reproduce and replicate the analyses from the corresponding publications. A complete description of each experiment and replication procedures are available in the original papers and their supplementary materials (Mullinix et al. 2015; Coppock 2018) as well as on the TESS website study archives: <http://www.tessexperiments.org/previousstudies.html>.

*Alexander Coppock is Assistant Professor of Political Science, Yale University, Thomas J. Leeper is Associate Professor in Political Behaviour, London School of Economics and Political Science, Kevin J. Mullinix is Assistant Professor of Political Science, Appalachian State University.

Table 1: Bergan (2012) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|----------|------|------|----------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.22 | 0.22 | 0.32 | [-0.65, 0.21] | 139 | 0.18 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.20 | 0.17 | 0.24 | [-0.55, 0.14] | 134 | 0.17 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.12 | 0.23 | 0.61 | [-0.34, 0.58] | 123 | 0.16 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.16 | 0.18 | 0.35 | [-0.18, 0.51] | 206 | 0.26 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.90 | 0.44 | 0.07 | [-0.07, 1.86] | 14 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.54 | 0.17 | 0.00 | [-0.88, -0.21] | 176 | 0.22 |
| Race: White | -0.17 | 0.13 | 0.19 | [-0.41, 0.08] | 285 | 0.36 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.06 | 0.27 | 0.83 | [-0.59, 0.48] | 111 | 0.14 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.19 | 0.15 | 0.19 | [-0.48, 0.10] | 283 | 0.36 |
| Education: College | 0.18 | 0.27 | 0.50 | [-0.36, 0.73] | 66 | 0.08 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.39 | 0.33 | 0.24 | [-1.06, 0.28] | 47 | 0.06 |
| Gender: Male | -0.04 | 0.16 | 0.81 | [-0.36, 0.28] | 204 | 0.26 |
| Gender: Female | -0.22 | 0.18 | 0.22 | [-0.58, 0.14] | 192 | 0.24 |
| Ideology: Liberal | 0.44 | 0.21 | 0.04 | [0.02, 0.86] | 113 | 0.14 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -0.01 | 0.18 | 0.94 | [-0.37, 0.34] | 134 | 0.17 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.72 | 0.22 | 0.00 | [-1.15, -0.29] | 149 | 0.19 |

| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|----------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.37 | 0.09 | 0.00 | [0.20, 0.54] | 480 | 0.41 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.15 | 0.21 | 0.46 | [-0.56, 0.26] | 91 | 0.08 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.15 | 0.53 | 0.78 | [-0.98, 1.28] | 16 | 0.01 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.51 | 0.10 | 0.00 | [0.32, 0.71] | 375 | 0.32 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.10 | 0.20 | 0.64 | [-0.31, 0.50] | 84 | 0.07 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.39 | 0.18 | 0.03 | [-0.74, -0.04] | 128 | 0.11 |
| Race: White | 0.23 | 0.09 | 0.01 | [0.05, 0.41] | 461 | 0.39 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.36 | 0.17 | 0.04 | [0.02, 0.70] | 126 | 0.11 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.32 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [0.10, 0.54] | 311 | 0.26 |
| Education: College | 0.04 | 0.13 | 0.78 | [-0.22, 0.29] | 223 | 0.19 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.76 | 0.26 | 0.00 | [0.24, 1.27] | 53 | 0.05 |
| Gender: Male | 0.21 | 0.11 | 0.06 | [-0.01, 0.42] | 327 | 0.28 |
| Gender: Female | 0.29 | 0.12 | 0.01 | [0.06, 0.52] | 260 | 0.22 |
| Ideology: Liberal | 0.50 | 0.10 | 0.00 | [0.30, 0.71] | 336 | 0.29 |
| Ideology: Moderate | 0.25 | 0.17 | 0.14 | [-0.08, 0.58] | 138 | 0.12 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.48 | 0.18 | 0.01 | [-0.84, -0.12] | 113 | 0.10 |

Table 2: Brader (2005) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|---------------|------|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.09 | 0.23 | 0.70 | [-0.37, 0.54] | 95 | 0.17 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.72 | 0.33 | 0.03 | [0.06, 1.38] | 107 | 0.19 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.55 | 0.30 | 0.07 | [-0.04, 1.15] | 78 | 0.14 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.55 | 0.31 | 0.08 | [-0.07, 1.17] | 108 | 0.19 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.46 | 0.25 | 0.07 | [-0.05, 0.96] | 54 | 0.10 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.55 | 0.28 | 0.05 | [-0.00, 1.11] | 118 | 0.21 |
| Race: White | 0.47 | 0.18 | 0.01 | [0.13, 0.82] | 280 | 0.50 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.23 | 0.20 | 0.25 | [-0.17, 0.63] | 193 | 0.34 |
| Education: College | 0.83 | 0.38 | 0.03 | [0.07, 1.59] | 58 | 0.10 |
| Education: Graduate School | 1.11 | 0.50 | 0.04 | [0.08, 2.14] | 29 | 0.05 |
| Gender: Male | 0.34 | 0.25 | 0.18 | [-0.16, 0.83] | 134 | 0.24 |
| Gender: Female | 0.61 | 0.25 | 0.02 | [0.11, 1.11] | 146 | 0.26 |
| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | | N | Prop |
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.35 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.22, 0.47] | 1297 | 0.38 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.26 | 0.13 | 0.05 | [0.00, 0.51] | 356 | 0.10 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.43 | 0.36 | 0.24 | [-0.29, 1.15] | 56 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.30 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.17, 0.44] | 1044 | 0.31 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.47 | 0.16 | 0.00 | [0.16, 0.77] | 270 | 0.08 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.26 | 0.13 | 0.04 | [0.01, 0.51] | 395 | 0.12 |
| Race: White | 0.31 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.17, 0.44] | 1293 | 0.38 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.34 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [0.12, 0.55] | 416 | 0.12 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.27 | 0.09 | 0.00 | [0.10, 0.44] | 852 | 0.25 |
| Education: College | 0.30 | 0.09 | 0.00 | [0.12, 0.48] | 649 | 0.19 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.51 | 0.16 | 0.00 | [0.20, 0.82] | 208 | 0.06 |
| Gender: Male | 0.19 | 0.09 | 0.02 | [0.03, 0.36] | 825 | 0.24 |
| Gender: Female | 0.42 | 0.08 | 0.00 | [0.26, 0.58] | 884 | 0.26 |

Table 3: Brandt (2013) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|----------------|------|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.44 | 0.19 | 0.02 | [-0.82, -0.07] | 153 | 0.12 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.37 | 0.14 | 0.01 | [-0.65, -0.09] | 271 | 0.22 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.47 | 0.17 | 0.01 | [-0.81, -0.12] | 201 | 0.16 |
| Party ID: Democrat | -0.53 | 0.14 | 0.00 | [-0.81, -0.26] | 324 | 0.26 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.49 | 0.54 | 0.38 | [-0.63, 1.60] | 26 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.33 | 0.15 | 0.04 | [-0.63, -0.02] | 275 | 0.22 |
| Race: White | -0.41 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [-0.63, -0.19] | 464 | 0.37 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.38 | 0.20 | 0.05 | [-0.78, 0.01] | 161 | 0.13 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.43 | 0.12 | 0.00 | [-0.66, -0.19] | 450 | 0.36 |
| Education: College | -0.60 | 0.23 | 0.01 | [-1.05, -0.14] | 110 | 0.09 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.15 | 0.30 | 0.61 | [-0.45, 0.75] | 65 | 0.05 |
| Gender: Male | -0.30 | 0.16 | 0.05 | [-0.61, 0.00] | 311 | 0.25 |
| Gender: Female | -0.49 | 0.13 | 0.00 | [-0.74, -0.24] | 314 | 0.25 |
| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | | N | Prop |
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.79 | 0.06 | 0.00 | [-0.89, -0.68] | 1210 | 0.38 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.80 | 0.10 | 0.00 | [-0.99, -0.60] | 310 | 0.10 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.51 | 0.25 | 0.04 | [-1.01, -0.02] | 52 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Democrat | -0.77 | 0.06 | 0.00 | [-0.89, -0.65] | 1029 | 0.33 |
| Party ID: Independent | -0.72 | 0.14 | 0.00 | [-1.00, -0.45] | 176 | 0.06 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.78 | 0.10 | 0.00 | [-0.97, -0.59] | 367 | 0.12 |
| Race: White | -0.81 | 0.05 | 0.00 | [-0.91, -0.71] | 1225 | 0.39 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.66 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [-0.89, -0.44] | 347 | 0.11 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.81 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [-0.94, -0.68] | 831 | 0.26 |
| Education: College | -0.78 | 0.08 | 0.00 | [-0.93, -0.62] | 586 | 0.19 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.58 | 0.15 | 0.00 | [-0.88, -0.28] | 155 | 0.05 |
| Gender: Male | -0.71 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [-0.85, -0.58] | 779 | 0.25 |
| Gender: Female | -0.83 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [-0.96, -0.70] | 793 | 0.25 |

Table 4: Caprariello and Reis (2013) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|----------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.42 | 0.28 | 0.14 | [-0.98, 0.14] | 117 | 0.15 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.15 | 0.23 | 0.52 | [-0.62, 0.31] | 150 | 0.19 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.07 | 0.20 | 0.71 | [-0.47, 0.32] | 132 | 0.17 |
| Party ID: Democrat | -0.49 | 0.21 | 0.02 | [-0.91, -0.06] | 197 | 0.25 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.00 | 0.43 | 1.00 | [-0.87, 0.87] | 46 | 0.06 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.05 | 0.21 | 0.80 | [-0.36, 0.47] | 156 | 0.20 |
| Race: White | -0.29 | 0.16 | 0.07 | [-0.61, 0.03] | 298 | 0.37 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.13 | 0.30 | 0.68 | [-0.73, 0.48] | 101 | 0.13 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.09 | 0.18 | 0.62 | [-0.43, 0.26] | 258 | 0.32 |
| Education: College | -0.49 | 0.30 | 0.11 | [-1.09, 0.11] | 79 | 0.10 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.77 | 0.36 | 0.04 | [-1.50, -0.05] | 62 | 0.08 |
| Gender: Male | -0.31 | 0.19 | 0.12 | [-0.69, 0.08] | 213 | 0.27 |
| Gender: Female | -0.17 | 0.22 | 0.44 | [-0.60, 0.26] | 186 | 0.23 |
| Ideology: Liberal | -0.58 | 0.30 | 0.06 | [-1.18, 0.01] | 114 | 0.14 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -0.13 | 0.25 | 0.59 | [-0.62, 0.36] | 136 | 0.17 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.11 | 0.21 | 0.58 | [-0.52, 0.30] | 149 | 0.19 |
| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.14 | 0.06 | 0.02 | [-0.26, -0.02] | 994 | 0.39 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.07 | 0.13 | 0.61 | [-0.32, 0.18] | 241 | 0.09 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.19 | 0.29 | 0.50 | [-0.78, 0.39] | 47 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Democrat | -0.08 | 0.07 | 0.26 | [-0.21, 0.06] | 796 | 0.31 |
| Party ID: Independent | -0.24 | 0.16 | 0.15 | [-0.56, 0.09] | 161 | 0.06 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.19 | 0.11 | 0.08 | [-0.40, 0.02] | 325 | 0.13 |
| Race: White | -0.15 | 0.06 | 0.02 | [-0.27, -0.03] | 969 | 0.38 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.06 | 0.12 | 0.59 | [-0.30, 0.17] | 313 | 0.12 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.15 | 0.08 | 0.05 | [-0.30, -0.00] | 705 | 0.27 |
| Education: College | -0.07 | 0.09 | 0.42 | [-0.24, 0.10] | 446 | 0.17 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.18 | 0.18 | 0.30 | [-0.53, 0.16] | 131 | 0.05 |
| Gender: Male | -0.06 | 0.08 | 0.43 | [-0.21, 0.09] | 616 | 0.24 |
| Gender: Female | -0.19 | 0.08 | 0.01 | [-0.34, -0.04] | 666 | 0.26 |
| Ideology: Liberal | -0.07 | 0.07 | 0.32 | [-0.21, 0.07] | 721 | 0.28 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -0.28 | 0.12 | 0.02 | [-0.51, -0.05] | 299 | 0.12 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.10 | 0.12 | 0.41 | [-0.35, 0.14] | 262 | 0.10 |

Table 5: Chong and Druckman (2010) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|----------|------|------|--------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.68 | 0.12 | 0.00 | [0.44, 0.92] | 231 | 0.12 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.88 | 0.09 | 0.00 | [0.69, 1.06] | 380 | 0.20 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.81 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [0.59, 1.02] | 347 | 0.18 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.75 | 0.09 | 0.00 | [0.56, 0.93] | 413 | 0.22 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.89 | 0.13 | 0.00 | [0.64, 1.14] | 213 | 0.11 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.81 | 0.10 | 0.00 | [0.61, 1.01] | 332 | 0.17 |
| Race: White | 0.79 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.65, 0.93] | 699 | 0.36 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.85 | 0.12 | 0.00 | [0.62, 1.08] | 259 | 0.14 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.81 | 0.08 | 0.00 | [0.65, 0.96] | 528 | 0.28 |
| Education: College | 0.82 | 0.12 | 0.00 | [0.58, 1.05] | 281 | 0.15 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.80 | 0.17 | 0.00 | [0.47, 1.13] | 149 | 0.08 |
| Gender: Male | 0.73 | 0.09 | 0.00 | [0.55, 0.91] | 495 | 0.26 |
| Gender: Female | 0.88 | 0.08 | 0.00 | [0.71, 1.04] | 463 | 0.24 |

| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|--------------|------|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.54 | 0.06 | 0.00 | [0.41, 0.66] | 1056 | 0.38 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.74 | 0.12 | 0.00 | [0.50, 0.98] | 298 | 0.11 |
| Age: More than 60 | 1.19 | 0.31 | 0.00 | [0.57, 1.80] | 46 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.56 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.42, 0.69] | 812 | 0.29 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.61 | 0.12 | 0.00 | [0.37, 0.85] | 264 | 0.09 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.69 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [0.48, 0.90] | 324 | 0.12 |
| Race: White | 0.64 | 0.06 | 0.00 | [0.52, 0.77] | 959 | 0.34 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.52 | 0.09 | 0.00 | [0.33, 0.70] | 441 | 0.16 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.68 | 0.08 | 0.00 | [0.53, 0.83] | 677 | 0.24 |
| Education: College | 0.54 | 0.09 | 0.00 | [0.36, 0.71] | 546 | 0.20 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.53 | 0.16 | 0.00 | [0.21, 0.85] | 177 | 0.06 |
| Gender: Male | 0.50 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.35, 0.64] | 809 | 0.29 |
| Gender: Female | 0.74 | 0.08 | 0.00 | [0.58, 0.89] | 591 | 0.21 |

Table 6: Craig and Richeson (2014) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|----------|------|------|---------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.23 | 0.16 | 0.16 | [-0.09, 0.55] | 188 | 0.15 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.14 | 0.16 | 0.37 | [-0.45, 0.17] | 237 | 0.19 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.18 | 0.15 | 0.23 | [-0.48, 0.12] | 183 | 0.15 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.14 | 0.14 | 0.31 | [-0.13, 0.41] | 298 | 0.25 |
| Party ID: Independent | -0.00 | 0.56 | 1.00 | [-1.18, 1.18] | 18 | 0.01 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.19 | 0.13 | 0.16 | [-0.46, 0.08] | 292 | 0.24 |
| Race: White | -0.13 | 0.10 | 0.22 | [-0.33, 0.08] | 464 | 0.38 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.23 | 0.19 | 0.23 | [-0.15, 0.60] | 144 | 0.12 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.04 | 0.11 | 0.71 | [-0.18, 0.26] | 415 | 0.34 |
| Education: College | -0.20 | 0.24 | 0.41 | [-0.68, 0.28] | 110 | 0.09 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.03 | 0.28 | 0.91 | [-0.53, 0.59] | 83 | 0.07 |
| Gender: Male | -0.00 | 0.15 | 1.00 | [-0.29, 0.29] | 296 | 0.24 |
| Gender: Female | -0.00 | 0.12 | 0.97 | [-0.25, 0.24] | 312 | 0.26 |
| Ideology: Liberal | 0.05 | 0.18 | 0.78 | [-0.30, 0.40] | 147 | 0.12 |
| Ideology: Moderate | 0.12 | 0.15 | 0.42 | [-0.18, 0.42] | 226 | 0.19 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.20 | 0.16 | 0.22 | [-0.52, 0.12] | 235 | 0.19 |

| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|----------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.25 | 0.08 | 0.00 | [-0.41, -0.09] | 524 | 0.37 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.13 | 0.16 | 0.43 | [-0.44, 0.18] | 158 | 0.11 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.34 | 0.43 | 0.43 | [-1.23, 0.54] | 27 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Democrat | -0.29 | 0.08 | 0.00 | [-0.46, -0.13] | 422 | 0.30 |
| Party ID: Independent | -0.40 | 0.22 | 0.08 | [-0.85, 0.05] | 96 | 0.07 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.10 | 0.14 | 0.48 | [-0.18, 0.37] | 191 | 0.13 |
| Race: White | -0.19 | 0.08 | 0.02 | [-0.35, -0.02] | 569 | 0.40 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.36 | 0.14 | 0.01 | [-0.64, -0.08] | 140 | 0.10 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.29 | 0.11 | 0.01 | [-0.51, -0.08] | 344 | 0.24 |
| Education: College | -0.07 | 0.11 | 0.51 | [-0.29, 0.14] | 290 | 0.20 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.40 | 0.23 | 0.09 | [-0.86, 0.06] | 75 | 0.05 |
| Gender: Male | -0.12 | 0.10 | 0.23 | [-0.33, 0.08] | 331 | 0.23 |
| Gender: Female | -0.30 | 0.10 | 0.00 | [-0.51, -0.10] | 378 | 0.27 |
| Ideology: Liberal | -0.26 | 0.09 | 0.01 | [-0.44, -0.07] | 328 | 0.23 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -0.35 | 0.13 | 0.01 | [-0.60, -0.10] | 216 | 0.15 |
| Ideology: Conservative | 0.08 | 0.16 | 0.60 | [-0.23, 0.40] | 165 | 0.12 |

Table 7: Denny (2012) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|----------|------|------|---------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.51 | 0.27 | 0.06 | [-0.02, 1.04] | 99 | 0.17 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.35 | 0.20 | 0.07 | [-0.04, 0.74] | 163 | 0.28 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.40 | 0.42 | 0.34 | [-1.26, 0.45] | 31 | 0.05 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.54 | 0.20 | 0.01 | [0.13, 0.94] | 158 | 0.27 |
| Party ID: Independent | -0.45 | 0.56 | 0.45 | [-1.77, 0.87] | 9 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.13 | 0.23 | 0.58 | [-0.33, 0.58] | 126 | 0.22 |
| Race: White | 0.04 | 0.15 | 0.78 | [-0.26, 0.35] | 219 | 0.37 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 1.04 | 0.29 | 0.00 | [0.47, 1.62] | 74 | 0.13 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.26 | 0.19 | 0.18 | [-0.12, 0.64] | 175 | 0.30 |
| Education: College | 0.75 | 0.31 | 0.02 | [0.13, 1.37] | 72 | 0.12 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.12 | 0.32 | 0.72 | [-0.53, 0.77] | 46 | 0.08 |
| Gender: Male | 0.24 | 0.23 | 0.31 | [-0.22, 0.70] | 146 | 0.25 |
| Gender: Female | 0.49 | 0.19 | 0.01 | [0.11, 0.87] | 147 | 0.25 |
| Ideology: Liberal | 0.79 | 0.29 | 0.01 | [0.22, 1.37] | 85 | 0.15 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -0.04 | 0.24 | 0.88 | [-0.51, 0.44] | 110 | 0.19 |
| Ideology: Conservative | 0.34 | 0.24 | 0.16 | [-0.13, 0.81] | 98 | 0.17 |

| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|---------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.09 | 0.12 | 0.46 | [-0.14, 0.32] | 237 | 0.39 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.18 | 0.27 | 0.50 | [-0.36, 0.72] | 53 | 0.09 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.56 | 0.62 | 0.39 | [-1.96, 0.84] | 11 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.08 | 0.14 | 0.56 | [-0.19, 0.35] | 181 | 0.30 |
| Party ID: Independent | -0.20 | 0.31 | 0.52 | [-0.83, 0.42] | 40 | 0.07 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.17 | 0.20 | 0.40 | [-0.23, 0.58] | 80 | 0.13 |
| Race: White | 0.01 | 0.12 | 0.96 | [-0.23, 0.24] | 236 | 0.39 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.31 | 0.24 | 0.20 | [-0.17, 0.79] | 65 | 0.11 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.13 | 0.15 | 0.38 | [-0.16, 0.42] | 157 | 0.26 |
| Education: College | 0.13 | 0.16 | 0.42 | [-0.19, 0.46] | 119 | 0.20 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.27 | 0.39 | 0.48 | [-1.07, 0.52] | 25 | 0.04 |
| Gender: Male | -0.11 | 0.14 | 0.44 | [-0.40, 0.17] | 156 | 0.26 |
| Gender: Female | 0.27 | 0.15 | 0.08 | [-0.04, 0.57] | 145 | 0.24 |
| Ideology: Liberal | 0.14 | 0.14 | 0.32 | [-0.14, 0.43] | 154 | 0.26 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -0.13 | 0.23 | 0.59 | [-0.58, 0.33] | 81 | 0.13 |
| Ideology: Conservative | 0.07 | 0.21 | 0.74 | [-0.35, 0.49] | 66 | 0.11 |

Table 8: Epley et al. (2009) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|----------|------|------|---------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.24 | 0.17 | 0.15 | [-0.09, 0.56] | 177 | 0.17 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.30 | 0.17 | 0.09 | [-0.04, 0.63] | 214 | 0.21 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.35 | 0.25 | 0.16 | [-0.14, 0.84] | 117 | 0.12 |
| Race: White | 0.23 | 0.12 | 0.06 | [-0.01, 0.48] | 395 | 0.39 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.39 | 0.21 | 0.06 | [-0.01, 0.80] | 113 | 0.11 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.29 | 0.13 | 0.02 | [0.04, 0.53] | 360 | 0.35 |
| Education: College | 0.07 | 0.27 | 0.79 | [-0.47, 0.62] | 93 | 0.09 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.66 | 0.33 | 0.05 | [0.00, 1.31] | 55 | 0.05 |
| Gender: Male | 0.45 | 0.15 | 0.00 | [0.16, 0.74] | 259 | 0.25 |
| Gender: Female | 0.13 | 0.15 | 0.40 | [-0.17, 0.43] | 249 | 0.25 |

| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|---------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.10 | 0.07 | 0.13 | [-0.03, 0.23] | 705 | 0.39 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.15 | 0.16 | 0.34 | [-0.47, 0.17] | 155 | 0.09 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.18 | 0.33 | 0.60 | [-0.50, 0.85] | 33 | 0.02 |
| Race: White | 0.05 | 0.07 | 0.45 | [-0.08, 0.19] | 696 | 0.39 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.13 | 0.13 | 0.32 | [-0.13, 0.38] | 197 | 0.11 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.04 | 0.08 | 0.65 | [-0.20, 0.12] | 487 | 0.27 |
| Education: College | 0.19 | 0.11 | 0.07 | [-0.02, 0.40] | 315 | 0.18 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.21 | 0.20 | 0.29 | [-0.18, 0.60] | 91 | 0.05 |
| Gender: Male | 0.12 | 0.08 | 0.14 | [-0.04, 0.27] | 483 | 0.27 |
| Gender: Female | 0.02 | 0.10 | 0.84 | [-0.17, 0.21] | 410 | 0.23 |

Table 9: Flavin (2011) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|----------|------|------|----------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.65 | 0.15 | 0.00 | [-0.96, -0.35] | 219 | 0.14 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.74 | 0.14 | 0.00 | [-1.02, -0.46] | 300 | 0.19 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.84 | 0.15 | 0.00 | [-1.15, -0.54] | 251 | 0.16 |
| Party ID: Democrat | -0.68 | 0.12 | 0.00 | [-0.91, -0.44] | 399 | 0.26 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.05 | 0.60 | 0.93 | [-1.27, 1.38] | 13 | 0.01 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.78 | 0.14 | 0.00 | [-1.05, -0.51] | 358 | 0.23 |
| Race: White | -0.75 | 0.10 | 0.00 | [-0.95, -0.55] | 601 | 0.39 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.71 | 0.17 | 0.00 | [-1.04, -0.37] | 169 | 0.11 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.87 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [-1.07, -0.66] | 514 | 0.33 |
| Education: College | -0.39 | 0.20 | 0.06 | [-0.79, 0.01] | 157 | 0.10 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.39 | 0.24 | 0.12 | [-0.87, 0.10] | 99 | 0.06 |
| Gender: Male | -0.75 | 0.13 | 0.00 | [-1.00, -0.50] | 389 | 0.25 |
| Gender: Female | -0.72 | 0.12 | 0.00 | [-0.97, -0.48] | 381 | 0.25 |
| Ideology: Liberal | -0.71 | 0.17 | 0.00 | [-1.04, -0.39] | 209 | 0.14 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -0.59 | 0.15 | 0.00 | [-0.88, -0.29] | 277 | 0.18 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.87 | 0.15 | 0.00 | [-1.15, -0.58] | 284 | 0.18 |

| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|----------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.39 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [-0.53, -0.25] | 795 | 0.40 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.57 | 0.15 | 0.00 | [-0.86, -0.27] | 179 | 0.09 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.68 | 0.49 | 0.18 | [-1.68, 0.33] | 29 | 0.01 |
| Party ID: Democrat | -0.31 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [-0.45, -0.17] | 621 | 0.31 |
| Party ID: Independent | -0.47 | 0.16 | 0.00 | [-0.79, -0.16] | 139 | 0.07 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.69 | 0.14 | 0.00 | [-0.97, -0.40] | 243 | 0.12 |
| Race: White | -0.39 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [-0.54, -0.25] | 766 | 0.38 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.54 | 0.12 | 0.00 | [-0.78, -0.30] | 237 | 0.12 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.38 | 0.08 | 0.00 | [-0.55, -0.22] | 545 | 0.27 |
| Education: College | -0.43 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [-0.64, -0.22] | 356 | 0.18 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.65 | 0.20 | 0.00 | [-1.05, -0.25] | 102 | 0.05 |
| Gender: Male | -0.31 | 0.10 | 0.00 | [-0.50, -0.12] | 497 | 0.25 |
| Gender: Female | -0.56 | 0.08 | 0.00 | [-0.72, -0.40] | 506 | 0.25 |
| Ideology: Liberal | -0.34 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [-0.49, -0.20] | 578 | 0.29 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -0.24 | 0.13 | 0.06 | [-0.49, 0.01] | 224 | 0.11 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.98 | 0.15 | 0.00 | [-1.29, -0.68] | 201 | 0.10 |

Table 10: Gash and Murakami (2009) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|----------------|------|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.73 | 0.22 | 0.00 | [-1.16, -0.30] | 159 | 0.16 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.51 | 0.18 | 0.01 | [-0.86, -0.15] | 203 | 0.20 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.92 | 0.20 | 0.00 | [-1.33, -0.52] | 134 | 0.14 |
| Party ID: Democrat | -0.89 | 0.15 | 0.00 | [-1.18, -0.60] | 263 | 0.27 |
| Party ID: Independent | -1.62 | 0.50 | 0.01 | [-2.71, -0.53] | 15 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.38 | 0.20 | 0.05 | [-0.77, 0.01] | 218 | 0.22 |
| Race: White | -0.63 | 0.13 | 0.00 | [-0.88, -0.39] | 384 | 0.39 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.82 | 0.26 | 0.00 | [-1.34, -0.30] | 112 | 0.11 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.84 | 0.14 | 0.00 | [-1.12, -0.56] | 358 | 0.36 |
| Education: College | -0.41 | 0.22 | 0.07 | [-0.85, 0.03] | 85 | 0.09 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.10 | 0.36 | 0.79 | [-0.81, 0.62] | 53 | 0.05 |
| Gender: Male | -0.64 | 0.16 | 0.00 | [-0.95, -0.32] | 258 | 0.26 |
| Gender: Female | -0.74 | 0.17 | 0.00 | [-1.08, -0.40] | 238 | 0.24 |
| Ideology: Liberal | -0.62 | 0.24 | 0.01 | [-1.08, -0.15] | 133 | 0.13 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -0.86 | 0.19 | 0.00 | [-1.22, -0.49] | 185 | 0.19 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.57 | 0.20 | 0.00 | [-0.97, -0.18] | 178 | 0.18 |
| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.71 | 0.06 | 0.00 | [-0.83, -0.60] | 1152 | 0.38 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.50 | 0.12 | 0.00 | [-0.75, -0.26] | 312 | 0.10 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.70 | 0.26 | 0.01 | [-1.22, -0.18] | 55 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Democrat | -0.65 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [-0.78, -0.52] | 964 | 0.32 |
| Party ID: Independent | -1.03 | 0.16 | 0.00 | [-1.35, -0.72] | 167 | 0.05 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.61 | 0.10 | 0.00 | [-0.81, -0.40] | 388 | 0.13 |
| Race: White | -0.69 | 0.06 | 0.00 | [-0.81, -0.57] | 1154 | 0.38 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.63 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [-0.83, -0.42] | 365 | 0.12 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.75 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [-0.90, -0.61] | 790 | 0.26 |
| Education: College | -0.62 | 0.09 | 0.00 | [-0.79, -0.45] | 564 | 0.19 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.42 | 0.17 | 0.01 | [-0.75, -0.09] | 165 | 0.05 |
| Gender: Male | -0.72 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [-0.87, -0.58] | 748 | 0.25 |
| Gender: Female | -0.63 | 0.08 | 0.00 | [-0.78, -0.48] | 771 | 0.25 |
| Ideology: Liberal | -0.72 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [-0.86, -0.58] | 879 | 0.29 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -0.64 | 0.12 | 0.00 | [-0.86, -0.41] | 296 | 0.10 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.64 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [-0.86, -0.43] | 344 | 0.11 |

Table 11: Hiscox (2006) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|---------------|------|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.36 | 0.09 | 0.00 | [0.17, 0.54] | 545 | 0.07 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.14 | 0.09 | 0.13 | [-0.04, 0.32] | 648 | 0.08 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.21 | 0.12 | 0.06 | [-0.01, 0.44] | 408 | 0.05 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.17 | 0.09 | 0.06 | [-0.00, 0.34] | 697 | 0.09 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.32 | 0.14 | 0.02 | [0.06, 0.59] | 286 | 0.04 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.27 | 0.09 | 0.00 | [0.09, 0.44] | 618 | 0.08 |
| Race: White | 0.26 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.14, 0.39] | 1198 | 0.15 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.13 | 0.12 | 0.29 | [-0.11, 0.36] | 406 | 0.05 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.25 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.11, 0.40] | 1049 | 0.13 |
| Education: College | 0.27 | 0.11 | 0.01 | [0.06, 0.48] | 348 | 0.04 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.03 | 0.15 | 0.84 | [-0.33, 0.27] | 204 | 0.03 |
| Gender: Male | 0.13 | 0.09 | 0.14 | [-0.04, 0.30] | 672 | 0.08 |
| Gender: Female | 0.30 | 0.08 | 0.00 | [0.15, 0.45] | 932 | 0.12 |
| Ideology: Liberal | 0.21 | 0.13 | 0.12 | [-0.06, 0.47] | 257 | 0.03 |
| Ideology: Moderate | 0.28 | 0.08 | 0.00 | [0.13, 0.43] | 918 | 0.11 |
| Ideology: Conservative | 0.13 | 0.11 | 0.25 | [-0.09, 0.35] | 426 | 0.05 |
| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | | N | Prop |
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.27 | 0.04 | 0.00 | [0.19, 0.34] | 1875 | 0.13 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.25 | 0.06 | 0.00 | [0.13, 0.37] | 850 | 0.06 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.19 | 0.11 | 0.10 | [-0.04, 0.41] | 238 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.22 | 0.04 | 0.00 | [0.15, 0.30] | 1767 | 0.12 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.33 | 0.08 | 0.00 | [0.17, 0.50] | 426 | 0.03 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.30 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.17, 0.42] | 770 | 0.05 |
| Race: White | 0.27 | 0.04 | 0.00 | [0.20, 0.34] | 2259 | 0.15 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.21 | 0.06 | 0.00 | [0.10, 0.32] | 707 | 0.05 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.29 | 0.04 | 0.00 | [0.20, 0.38] | 1531 | 0.10 |
| Education: College | 0.22 | 0.05 | 0.00 | [0.12, 0.32] | 1066 | 0.07 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.20 | 0.08 | 0.01 | [0.05, 0.35] | 366 | 0.02 |
| Gender: Male | 0.21 | 0.04 | 0.00 | [0.13, 0.29] | 1431 | 0.10 |
| Gender: Female | 0.30 | 0.05 | 0.00 | [0.21, 0.39] | 1535 | 0.10 |
| Ideology: Liberal | 0.21 | 0.04 | 0.00 | [0.13, 0.30] | 1406 | 0.09 |
| Ideology: Moderate | 0.28 | 0.06 | 0.00 | [0.17, 0.39] | 957 | 0.06 |
| Ideology: Conservative | 0.32 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.17, 0.46] | 600 | 0.04 |

Table 12: Hopkins and Mummolo (2017) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|----------|------|------|----------------|------|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.19 | 0.08 | 0.01 | [-0.33, -0.04] | 928 | 0.14 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.16 | 0.07 | 0.03 | [-0.30, -0.02] | 1323 | 0.20 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.14 | 0.08 | 0.09 | [-0.30, 0.02] | 1015 | 0.16 |
| Party ID: Democrat | -0.21 | 0.06 | 0.00 | [-0.32, -0.10] | 1678 | 0.26 |
| Party ID: Independent | -0.13 | 0.22 | 0.56 | [-0.57, 0.31] | 80 | 0.01 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.08 | 0.07 | 0.27 | [-0.22, 0.06] | 1508 | 0.23 |
| Race: White | -0.16 | 0.05 | 0.00 | [-0.27, -0.06] | 2478 | 0.38 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.16 | 0.08 | 0.05 | [-0.31, 0.00] | 788 | 0.12 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.21 | 0.05 | 0.00 | [-0.31, -0.10] | 2154 | 0.33 |
| Education: College | 0.01 | 0.10 | 0.91 | [-0.19, 0.21] | 638 | 0.10 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.14 | 0.13 | 0.26 | [-0.39, 0.11] | 474 | 0.07 |
| Gender: Male | -0.20 | 0.06 | 0.00 | [-0.32, -0.07] | 1725 | 0.26 |
| Gender: Female | -0.12 | 0.06 | 0.04 | [-0.25, -0.00] | 1541 | 0.24 |
| Ideology: Liberal | -0.09 | 0.08 | 0.25 | [-0.24, 0.06] | 854 | 0.13 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -0.22 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [-0.36, -0.09] | 1155 | 0.18 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.14 | 0.08 | 0.07 | [-0.30, 0.01] | 1257 | 0.19 |

| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|----------------|------|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.18 | 0.05 | 0.00 | [-0.27, -0.09] | 1878 | 0.32 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.25 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [-0.39, -0.10] | 853 | 0.14 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.36 | 0.15 | 0.02 | [-0.66, -0.06] | 241 | 0.04 |
| Party ID: Democrat | -0.16 | 0.04 | 0.00 | [-0.25, -0.08] | 1770 | 0.30 |
| Party ID: Independent | -0.33 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [-0.56, -0.11] | 429 | 0.07 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.20 | 0.08 | 0.01 | [-0.36, -0.05] | 773 | 0.13 |
| Race: White | -0.21 | 0.04 | 0.00 | [-0.30, -0.12] | 2262 | 0.38 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.23 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [-0.38, -0.08] | 710 | 0.12 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.16 | 0.05 | 0.00 | [-0.27, -0.05] | 1534 | 0.26 |
| Education: College | -0.27 | 0.06 | 0.00 | [-0.39, -0.15] | 1069 | 0.18 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.27 | 0.10 | 0.01 | [-0.47, -0.08] | 369 | 0.06 |
| Gender: Male | -0.23 | 0.06 | 0.00 | [-0.34, -0.11] | 1434 | 0.24 |
| Gender: Female | -0.21 | 0.05 | 0.00 | [-0.30, -0.11] | 1538 | 0.26 |
| Ideology: Liberal | -0.18 | 0.05 | 0.00 | [-0.27, -0.09] | 1409 | 0.24 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -0.21 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [-0.34, -0.08] | 960 | 0.16 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.26 | 0.10 | 0.01 | [-0.45, -0.07] | 603 | 0.10 |

Table 13: Jacobsen, Snyder and Saultz (2014) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|----------|------|------|--------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.43 | 0.17 | 0.01 | [0.09, 0.76] | 187 | 0.17 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.47 | 0.14 | 0.00 | [0.19, 0.76] | 201 | 0.19 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.87 | 0.19 | 0.00 | [0.49, 1.25] | 154 | 0.14 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.57 | 0.14 | 0.00 | [0.30, 0.84] | 293 | 0.27 |
| Party ID: Independent | 1.59 | 0.56 | 0.02 | [0.29, 2.89] | 10 | 0.01 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.43 | 0.14 | 0.00 | [0.17, 0.70] | 239 | 0.22 |
| Race: White | 0.49 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [0.28, 0.70] | 392 | 0.36 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.68 | 0.20 | 0.00 | [0.27, 1.08] | 150 | 0.14 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.48 | 0.12 | 0.00 | [0.24, 0.72] | 386 | 0.36 |
| Education: College | 0.51 | 0.19 | 0.01 | [0.14, 0.89] | 95 | 0.09 |
| Education: Graduate School | 1.03 | 0.27 | 0.00 | [0.50, 1.56] | 61 | 0.06 |
| Gender: Male | 0.42 | 0.14 | 0.00 | [0.14, 0.69] | 271 | 0.25 |
| Gender: Female | 0.68 | 0.14 | 0.00 | [0.41, 0.94] | 271 | 0.25 |
| Ideology: Liberal | 0.43 | 0.18 | 0.02 | [0.07, 0.79] | 143 | 0.13 |
| Ideology: Moderate | 0.56 | 0.17 | 0.00 | [0.23, 0.90] | 192 | 0.18 |
| Ideology: Conservative | 0.63 | 0.15 | 0.00 | [0.33, 0.93] | 207 | 0.19 |

| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|---------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.47 | 0.05 | 0.00 | [0.36, 0.58] | 750 | 0.38 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.46 | 0.13 | 0.00 | [0.20, 0.72] | 205 | 0.10 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.55 | 0.34 | 0.12 | [-0.14, 1.25] | 37 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.49 | 0.06 | 0.00 | [0.37, 0.60] | 659 | 0.33 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.25 | 0.17 | 0.16 | [-0.10, 0.59] | 112 | 0.06 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.46 | 0.12 | 0.00 | [0.22, 0.70] | 221 | 0.11 |
| Race: White | 0.46 | 0.06 | 0.00 | [0.35, 0.58] | 776 | 0.39 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.43 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [0.21, 0.65] | 216 | 0.11 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.47 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.33, 0.61] | 564 | 0.28 |
| Education: College | 0.44 | 0.08 | 0.00 | [0.28, 0.61] | 321 | 0.16 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.49 | 0.16 | 0.00 | [0.17, 0.81] | 107 | 0.05 |
| Gender: Male | 0.50 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.37, 0.63] | 516 | 0.26 |
| Gender: Female | 0.42 | 0.08 | 0.00 | [0.26, 0.57] | 476 | 0.24 |
| Ideology: Liberal | 0.52 | 0.06 | 0.00 | [0.39, 0.64] | 558 | 0.28 |
| Ideology: Moderate | 0.27 | 0.11 | 0.01 | [0.06, 0.48] | 234 | 0.12 |
| Ideology: Conservative | 0.51 | 0.13 | 0.00 | [0.25, 0.77] | 200 | 0.10 |

Table 14: Johnston and Ballard (2016) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|----------|------|------|---------------|------|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.30 | 0.09 | 0.00 | [0.13, 0.47] | 670 | 0.16 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.22 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.08, 0.36] | 769 | 0.19 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.23 | 0.09 | 0.01 | [0.06, 0.40] | 606 | 0.15 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.23 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.10, 0.37] | 1044 | 0.26 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.14 | 0.22 | 0.53 | [-0.30, 0.57] | 89 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.28 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.15, 0.42] | 912 | 0.22 |
| Race: White | 0.24 | 0.05 | 0.00 | [0.14, 0.34] | 1495 | 0.37 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.27 | 0.10 | 0.00 | [0.09, 0.46] | 550 | 0.13 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.27 | 0.05 | 0.00 | [0.16, 0.37] | 1363 | 0.33 |
| Education: College | 0.29 | 0.11 | 0.01 | [0.07, 0.51] | 397 | 0.10 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.09 | 0.15 | 0.54 | [-0.20, 0.38] | 285 | 0.07 |
| Gender: Male | 0.27 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.13, 0.40] | 1013 | 0.25 |
| Gender: Female | 0.24 | 0.06 | 0.00 | [0.11, 0.36] | 1032 | 0.25 |
| Ideology: Liberal | 0.30 | 0.10 | 0.00 | [0.12, 0.49] | 551 | 0.13 |
| Ideology: Moderate | 0.23 | 0.08 | 0.00 | [0.08, 0.38] | 721 | 0.18 |
| Ideology: Conservative | 0.23 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.08, 0.37] | 773 | 0.19 |

| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|--------------|-------|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.42 | 0.02 | 0.00 | [0.38, 0.46] | 11285 | 0.38 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.37 | 0.03 | 0.00 | [0.31, 0.44] | 3135 | 0.11 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.29 | 0.09 | 0.00 | [0.11, 0.46] | 505 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.41 | 0.02 | 0.00 | [0.37, 0.45] | 9000 | 0.30 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.34 | 0.04 | 0.00 | [0.26, 0.42] | 2275 | 0.08 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.42 | 0.03 | 0.00 | [0.36, 0.49] | 3650 | 0.12 |
| Race: White | 0.40 | 0.02 | 0.00 | [0.36, 0.43] | 11445 | 0.38 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.42 | 0.03 | 0.00 | [0.36, 0.49] | 3480 | 0.12 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.41 | 0.02 | 0.00 | [0.37, 0.46] | 7465 | 0.25 |
| Education: College | 0.39 | 0.03 | 0.00 | [0.34, 0.44] | 5710 | 0.19 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.40 | 0.05 | 0.00 | [0.31, 0.49] | 1750 | 0.06 |
| Gender: Male | 0.37 | 0.02 | 0.00 | [0.32, 0.41] | 7065 | 0.24 |
| Gender: Female | 0.44 | 0.02 | 0.00 | [0.40, 0.49] | 7860 | 0.26 |
| Ideology: Liberal | 0.39 | 0.02 | 0.00 | [0.34, 0.43] | 7000 | 0.23 |
| Ideology: Moderate | 0.40 | 0.03 | 0.00 | [0.35, 0.46] | 4900 | 0.16 |
| Ideology: Conservative | 0.46 | 0.04 | 0.00 | [0.39, 0.53] | 3025 | 0.10 |

Table 15: Levendusky and Malhotra (2015) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|---------------|------|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.20 | 0.15 | 0.17 | [-0.09, 0.49] | 345 | 0.16 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.04 | 0.13 | 0.77 | [-0.21, 0.29] | 397 | 0.19 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.25 | 0.14 | 0.07 | [-0.02, 0.53] | 311 | 0.15 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.18 | 0.11 | 0.11 | [-0.04, 0.40] | 469 | 0.22 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.20 | 0.27 | 0.45 | [-0.34, 0.74] | 36 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.14 | 0.12 | 0.24 | [-0.09, 0.36] | 548 | 0.26 |
| Race: White | 0.18 | 0.09 | 0.03 | [0.02, 0.35] | 777 | 0.37 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.11 | 0.17 | 0.51 | [-0.22, 0.44] | 276 | 0.13 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.18 | 0.10 | 0.08 | [-0.02, 0.38] | 700 | 0.33 |
| Education: College | 0.14 | 0.16 | 0.37 | [-0.17, 0.45] | 225 | 0.11 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.07 | 0.21 | 0.75 | [-0.35, 0.49] | 128 | 0.06 |
| Gender: Male | 0.14 | 0.12 | 0.22 | [-0.09, 0.38] | 548 | 0.26 |
| Gender: Female | 0.18 | 0.11 | 0.11 | [-0.04, 0.39] | 505 | 0.24 |
| Ideology: Liberal | 0.07 | 0.14 | 0.61 | [-0.20, 0.33] | 318 | 0.15 |
| Ideology: Moderate | 0.40 | 0.15 | 0.01 | [0.11, 0.70] | 348 | 0.17 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.00 | 0.13 | 1.00 | [-0.26, 0.26] | 387 | 0.18 |
| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | | N | Prop |
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.34 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.21, 0.47] | 1254 | 0.32 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.45 | 0.09 | 0.00 | [0.27, 0.62] | 576 | 0.14 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.13 | 0.17 | 0.45 | [-0.20, 0.45] | 157 | 0.04 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.41 | 0.06 | 0.00 | [0.29, 0.53] | 1189 | 0.30 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.22 | 0.14 | 0.12 | [-0.06, 0.50] | 288 | 0.07 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.33 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [0.12, 0.54] | 510 | 0.13 |
| Race: White | 0.35 | 0.06 | 0.00 | [0.24, 0.46] | 1513 | 0.38 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.40 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [0.18, 0.62] | 474 | 0.12 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.35 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.21, 0.49] | 1039 | 0.26 |
| Education: College | 0.36 | 0.09 | 0.00 | [0.19, 0.52] | 698 | 0.18 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.47 | 0.13 | 0.00 | [0.22, 0.72] | 250 | 0.06 |
| Gender: Male | 0.30 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.16, 0.44] | 966 | 0.24 |
| Gender: Female | 0.42 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.28, 0.56] | 1021 | 0.26 |
| Ideology: Liberal | 0.48 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.34, 0.61] | 947 | 0.24 |
| Ideology: Moderate | 0.34 | 0.09 | 0.00 | [0.15, 0.52] | 642 | 0.16 |
| Ideology: Conservative | 0.13 | 0.12 | 0.25 | [-0.10, 0.37] | 398 | 0.10 |

Table 16: McGinty, Webster and Barry (2013) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|---------------|------|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.08 | 0.08 | 0.35 | [-0.08, 0.23] | 796 | 0.07 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.14 | 0.07 | 0.04 | [0.01, 0.28] | 1170 | 0.10 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.13 | 0.08 | 0.11 | [-0.03, 0.29] | 963 | 0.08 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.09 | 0.06 | 0.13 | [-0.03, 0.21] | 1510 | 0.13 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.07 | 0.20 | 0.70 | [-0.31, 0.46] | 91 | 0.01 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.14 | 0.07 | 0.03 | [0.01, 0.28] | 1328 | 0.11 |
| Race: White | 0.15 | 0.05 | 0.00 | [0.05, 0.25] | 2226 | 0.19 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.04 | 0.09 | 0.61 | [-0.13, 0.22] | 705 | 0.06 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.16 | 0.05 | 0.00 | [0.05, 0.27] | 1952 | 0.17 |
| Education: College | -0.01 | 0.10 | 0.90 | [-0.20, 0.18] | 574 | 0.05 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.02 | 0.12 | 0.84 | [-0.22, 0.27] | 403 | 0.03 |
| Gender: Male | 0.09 | 0.06 | 0.17 | [-0.04, 0.21] | 1457 | 0.12 |
| Gender: Female | 0.14 | 0.06 | 0.02 | [0.02, 0.26] | 1474 | 0.13 |
| Ideology: Liberal | -0.03 | 0.09 | 0.71 | [-0.20, 0.14] | 836 | 0.07 |
| Ideology: Moderate | 0.27 | 0.07 | 0.00 | [0.13, 0.41] | 1008 | 0.09 |
| Ideology: Conservative | 0.06 | 0.07 | 0.38 | [-0.08, 0.21] | 1085 | 0.09 |
| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | | N | Prop |
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.00 | 0.04 | 0.95 | [-0.09, 0.09] | 1861 | 0.19 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.05 | 0.09 | 0.57 | [-0.12, 0.22] | 534 | 0.05 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.07 | 0.20 | 0.74 | [-0.46, 0.33] | 86 | 0.01 |
| Party ID: Democrat | -0.01 | 0.04 | 0.81 | [-0.09, 0.07] | 1504 | 0.15 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.08 | 0.10 | 0.42 | [-0.12, 0.29] | 370 | 0.04 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.02 | 0.08 | 0.78 | [-0.14, 0.18] | 607 | 0.06 |
| Race: White | -0.01 | 0.05 | 0.78 | [-0.10, 0.08] | 1925 | 0.19 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.09 | 0.08 | 0.23 | [-0.06, 0.25] | 558 | 0.06 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.01 | 0.06 | 0.82 | [-0.10, 0.13] | 1218 | 0.12 |
| Education: College | 0.00 | 0.06 | 0.98 | [-0.12, 0.12] | 960 | 0.10 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.05 | 0.10 | 0.66 | [-0.25, 0.16] | 303 | 0.03 |
| Gender: Male | -0.04 | 0.06 | 0.47 | [-0.16, 0.07] | 1149 | 0.12 |
| Gender: Female | 0.04 | 0.05 | 0.40 | [-0.06, 0.14] | 1334 | 0.13 |
| Ideology: Liberal | -0.05 | 0.05 | 0.26 | [-0.15, 0.04] | 1193 | 0.12 |
| Ideology: Moderate | 0.08 | 0.07 | 0.27 | [-0.06, 0.22] | 784 | 0.08 |
| Ideology: Conservative | 0.03 | 0.09 | 0.78 | [-0.15, 0.20] | 504 | 0.05 |

Table 17: Murtagh et al. (2012) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|----------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.36 | 0.24 | 0.13 | [-0.83, 0.11] | 80 | 0.15 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.40 | 0.25 | 0.11 | [-0.89, 0.09] | 110 | 0.20 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.65 | 0.31 | 0.04 | [-1.26, -0.04] | 81 | 0.15 |
| Race: White | -0.53 | 0.19 | 0.01 | [-0.89, -0.16] | 197 | 0.36 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.22 | 0.25 | 0.37 | [-0.72, 0.27] | 74 | 0.14 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.34 | 0.18 | 0.06 | [-0.69, 0.01] | 193 | 0.36 |
| Education: College | -0.61 | 0.32 | 0.06 | [-1.25, 0.04] | 49 | 0.09 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.78 | 0.55 | 0.16 | [-1.90, 0.34] | 29 | 0.05 |
| Gender: Male | -0.50 | 0.19 | 0.01 | [-0.88, -0.12] | 126 | 0.23 |
| Gender: Female | -0.37 | 0.23 | 0.11 | [-0.81, 0.08] | 145 | 0.27 |
| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | | N | Prop |
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.39 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [-0.60, -0.18] | 295 | 0.40 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.42 | 0.22 | 0.06 | [-0.86, 0.01] | 68 | 0.09 |
| Age: More than 60 | -1.55 | 1.15 | 0.25 | [-4.75, 1.66] | 6 | 0.01 |
| Race: White | -0.51 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [-0.73, -0.30] | 286 | 0.39 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.06 | 0.19 | 0.74 | [-0.45, 0.32] | 83 | 0.11 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.49 | 0.13 | 0.00 | [-0.73, -0.24] | 196 | 0.27 |
| Education: College | -0.22 | 0.16 | 0.17 | [-0.53, 0.10] | 138 | 0.19 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.89 | 0.30 | 0.01 | [-1.51, -0.27] | 35 | 0.05 |
| Gender: Male | -0.47 | 0.13 | 0.00 | [-0.73, -0.21] | 202 | 0.27 |
| Gender: Female | -0.34 | 0.14 | 0.01 | [-0.61, -0.07] | 167 | 0.23 |

Table 18: Nicholson (2012) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | | | |
|------------------------------|----------|------|------|---------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | N | Prop |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.28 | 0.20 | 0.16 | [-0.11, 0.67] | 182 | 0.08 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.09 | 0.12 | 0.44 | [-0.14, 0.33] | 363 | 0.16 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.39 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [0.17, 0.61] | 233 | 0.10 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.19 | 0.12 | 0.13 | [-0.06, 0.43] | 427 | 0.27 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.28 | 0.12 | 0.02 | [0.05, 0.51] | 354 | 0.23 |
| Race: White | 0.23 | 0.09 | 0.01 | [0.05, 0.41] | 616 | 0.26 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.28 | 0.19 | 0.14 | [-0.10, 0.66] | 163 | 0.07 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.19 | 0.11 | 0.08 | [-0.02, 0.40] | 525 | 0.22 |
| Education: College | 0.33 | 0.17 | 0.05 | [-0.01, 0.66] | 178 | 0.08 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.25 | 0.23 | 0.30 | [-0.22, 0.71] | 75 | 0.03 |
| Gender: Male | 0.11 | 0.12 | 0.37 | [-0.13, 0.34] | 412 | 0.18 |
| Gender: Female | 0.36 | 0.12 | 0.00 | [0.12, 0.60] | 367 | 0.16 |

| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | | | |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|---------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | N | Prop |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.12 | 0.07 | 0.10 | [-0.02, 0.26] | 817 | 0.25 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.07 | 0.14 | 0.62 | [-0.21, 0.34] | 233 | 0.07 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.05 | 0.28 | 0.86 | [-0.52, 0.62] | 46 | 0.01 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.05 | 0.07 | 0.44 | [-0.08, 0.19] | 736 | 0.33 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.22 | 0.13 | 0.08 | [-0.03, 0.47] | 363 | 0.17 |
| Race: White | 0.12 | 0.07 | 0.09 | [-0.02, 0.27] | 753 | 0.23 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.07 | 0.12 | 0.55 | [-0.16, 0.30] | 344 | 0.10 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.14 | 0.10 | 0.14 | [-0.05, 0.33] | 460 | 0.14 |
| Education: College | 0.08 | 0.09 | 0.40 | [-0.11, 0.26] | 481 | 0.15 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.08 | 0.14 | 0.60 | [-0.21, 0.36] | 155 | 0.05 |
| Gender: Male | 0.12 | 0.08 | 0.13 | [-0.04, 0.28] | 637 | 0.19 |
| Gender: Female | 0.08 | 0.10 | 0.42 | [-0.12, 0.27] | 460 | 0.14 |

Table 19: Parmer (2011) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|---------------|------|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.19 | 0.17 | 0.27 | [-0.15, 0.52] | 170 | 0.16 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.02 | 0.18 | 0.92 | [-0.33, 0.36] | 202 | 0.19 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.28 | 0.19 | 0.14 | [-0.65, 0.10] | 147 | 0.14 |
| Party ID: Democrat | -0.00 | 0.13 | 0.99 | [-0.25, 0.25] | 267 | 0.26 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.50 | 0.78 | 0.52 | [-1.13, 2.13] | 20 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.01 | 0.17 | 0.96 | [-0.33, 0.32] | 232 | 0.22 |
| Race: White | -0.08 | 0.12 | 0.53 | [-0.32, 0.16] | 373 | 0.36 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.20 | 0.19 | 0.31 | [-0.18, 0.58] | 146 | 0.14 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.04 | 0.13 | 0.74 | [-0.30, 0.22] | 367 | 0.35 |
| Education: College | 0.10 | 0.18 | 0.60 | [-0.27, 0.46] | 88 | 0.08 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.24 | 0.18 | 0.18 | [-0.11, 0.60] | 64 | 0.06 |
| Gender: Male | -0.10 | 0.12 | 0.37 | [-0.33, 0.12] | 271 | 0.26 |
| Gender: Female | 0.12 | 0.17 | 0.48 | [-0.21, 0.45] | 248 | 0.24 |
| Ideology: Liberal | 0.29 | 0.17 | 0.09 | [-0.04, 0.63] | 144 | 0.14 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -0.04 | 0.19 | 0.85 | [-0.42, 0.35] | 166 | 0.16 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.16 | 0.16 | 0.32 | [-0.48, 0.16] | 209 | 0.20 |
| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.03 | 0.04 | 0.45 | [-0.12, 0.05] | 1563 | 0.37 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.04 | 0.09 | 0.70 | [-0.22, 0.14] | 438 | 0.10 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.32 | 0.21 | 0.14 | [-0.74, 0.10] | 86 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.01 | 0.05 | 0.85 | [-0.08, 0.10] | 1295 | 0.31 |
| Party ID: Independent | -0.12 | 0.14 | 0.40 | [-0.39, 0.16] | 283 | 0.07 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.11 | 0.08 | 0.16 | [-0.27, 0.05] | 509 | 0.12 |
| Race: White | -0.07 | 0.04 | 0.10 | [-0.16, 0.01] | 1623 | 0.39 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.05 | 0.09 | 0.56 | [-0.12, 0.22] | 464 | 0.11 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.09 | 0.06 | 0.12 | [-0.21, 0.02] | 1100 | 0.26 |
| Education: College | 0.06 | 0.06 | 0.30 | [-0.06, 0.18] | 718 | 0.17 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.14 | 0.09 | 0.10 | [-0.31, 0.03] | 269 | 0.06 |
| Gender: Male | -0.06 | 0.06 | 0.26 | [-0.17, 0.05] | 998 | 0.24 |
| Gender: Female | -0.03 | 0.06 | 0.62 | [-0.14, 0.08] | 1089 | 0.26 |
| Ideology: Liberal | 0.01 | 0.05 | 0.84 | [-0.08, 0.10] | 1146 | 0.27 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -0.04 | 0.09 | 0.65 | [-0.22, 0.14] | 487 | 0.12 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.16 | 0.09 | 0.07 | [-0.34, 0.01] | 454 | 0.11 |

Table 20: Pedulla (2014) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|---------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.20 | 0.21 | 0.32 | [-0.21, 0.61] | 79 | 0.21 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.13 | 0.25 | 0.61 | [-0.63, 0.37] | 105 | 0.29 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.26 | 0.16 | 0.11 | [-0.06, 0.58] | 147 | 0.27 |
| Party ID: Independent | -2.02 | 0.75 | 0.07 | [-4.41, 0.37] | 5 | 0.01 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.09 | 0.24 | 0.71 | [-0.56, 0.38] | 122 | 0.22 |
| Race: White | 0.01 | 0.17 | 0.95 | [-0.33, 0.36] | 200 | 0.36 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.21 | 0.22 | 0.33 | [-0.22, 0.65] | 74 | 0.14 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.09 | 0.17 | 0.57 | [-0.23, 0.42] | 181 | 0.33 |
| Education: College | -0.09 | 0.32 | 0.77 | [-0.74, 0.55] | 68 | 0.12 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.30 | 0.31 | 0.35 | [-0.34, 0.94] | 25 | 0.05 |
| Gender: Male | 0.11 | 0.20 | 0.60 | [-0.30, 0.51] | 137 | 0.25 |
| Gender: Female | 0.05 | 0.18 | 0.79 | [-0.31, 0.41] | 137 | 0.25 |
| Ideology: Liberal | 0.45 | 0.27 | 0.10 | [-0.09, 0.99] | 71 | 0.13 |
| Ideology: Moderate | 0.06 | 0.18 | 0.74 | [-0.30, 0.42] | 105 | 0.19 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.13 | 0.26 | 0.60 | [-0.65, 0.38] | 98 | 0.18 |
| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | | N | Prop |
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.04 | 0.09 | 0.68 | [-0.14, 0.22] | 277 | 0.42 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.01 | 0.14 | 0.92 | [-0.29, 0.26] | 56 | 0.08 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.03 | 0.09 | 0.76 | [-0.15, 0.20] | 213 | 0.31 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.03 | 0.24 | 0.89 | [-0.45, 0.51] | 49 | 0.07 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.01 | 0.18 | 0.94 | [-0.34, 0.36] | 84 | 0.12 |
| Race: White | -0.04 | 0.08 | 0.63 | [-0.21, 0.12] | 279 | 0.40 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.30 | 0.18 | 0.10 | [-0.06, 0.67] | 67 | 0.10 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.09 | 0.11 | 0.40 | [-0.30, 0.12] | 190 | 0.27 |
| Education: College | 0.24 | 0.11 | 0.04 | [0.01, 0.46] | 123 | 0.18 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.06 | 0.28 | 0.82 | [-0.63, 0.51] | 33 | 0.05 |
| Gender: Male | -0.08 | 0.12 | 0.50 | [-0.31, 0.15] | 177 | 0.26 |
| Gender: Female | 0.13 | 0.10 | 0.18 | [-0.06, 0.33] | 169 | 0.24 |
| Ideology: Liberal | 0.01 | 0.10 | 0.91 | [-0.18, 0.20] | 204 | 0.29 |
| Ideology: Moderate | 0.11 | 0.21 | 0.61 | [-0.31, 0.52] | 73 | 0.11 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.07 | 0.13 | 0.61 | [-0.33, 0.20] | 69 | 0.10 |

Table 21: Peffley and Hurwitz (2007) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|----------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.38 | 0.14 | 0.01 | [-0.66, -0.11] | 382 | 0.21 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.44 | 0.16 | 0.01 | [-0.75, -0.13] | 373 | 0.21 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.33 | 0.16 | 0.04 | [-0.64, -0.02] | 150 | 0.08 |
| Race: White | -0.31 | 0.08 | 0.00 | [-0.47, -0.15] | 470 | 0.26 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.37 | 0.15 | 0.01 | [-0.66, -0.08] | 435 | 0.24 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.48 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [-0.70, -0.27] | 636 | 0.35 |
| Education: College | -0.40 | 0.18 | 0.03 | [-0.76, -0.04] | 193 | 0.11 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.16 | 0.28 | 0.57 | [-0.40, 0.71] | 76 | 0.04 |
| Gender: Male | -0.48 | 0.15 | 0.00 | [-0.78, -0.18] | 353 | 0.20 |
| Gender: Female | -0.36 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [-0.59, -0.13] | 552 | 0.30 |
| Ideology: Liberal | -0.33 | 0.15 | 0.03 | [-0.63, -0.04] | 206 | 0.11 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -0.48 | 0.13 | 0.00 | [-0.74, -0.22] | 442 | 0.24 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.34 | 0.19 | 0.08 | [-0.72, 0.04] | 257 | 0.14 |
| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | | N | Prop |
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.11 | 0.05 | 0.04 | [-0.22, -0.01] | 956 | 0.37 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.05 | 0.11 | 0.66 | [-0.27, 0.17] | 268 | 0.10 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.13 | 0.23 | 0.58 | [-0.59, 0.33] | 61 | 0.02 |
| Race: White | -0.08 | 0.06 | 0.17 | [-0.20, 0.04] | 875 | 0.34 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.15 | 0.08 | 0.05 | [-0.30, 0.00] | 410 | 0.16 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.17 | 0.07 | 0.02 | [-0.32, -0.02] | 535 | 0.21 |
| Education: College | -0.10 | 0.07 | 0.18 | [-0.23, 0.04] | 569 | 0.22 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.04 | 0.13 | 0.74 | [-0.21, 0.30] | 181 | 0.07 |
| Gender: Male | -0.16 | 0.06 | 0.01 | [-0.29, -0.04] | 737 | 0.29 |
| Gender: Female | -0.02 | 0.07 | 0.82 | [-0.16, 0.13] | 548 | 0.21 |
| Ideology: Liberal | -0.12 | 0.07 | 0.09 | [-0.26, 0.02] | 574 | 0.22 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -0.04 | 0.07 | 0.58 | [-0.18, 0.10] | 456 | 0.18 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.14 | 0.11 | 0.18 | [-0.35, 0.07] | 255 | 0.10 |

Table 22: Piazza (2015) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|----------|------|------|---------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.22 | 0.20 | 0.27 | [-0.17, 0.61] | 139 | 0.16 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.25 | 0.18 | 0.15 | [-0.60, 0.10] | 173 | 0.20 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.06 | 0.21 | 0.77 | [-0.35, 0.47] | 131 | 0.15 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.23 | 0.14 | 0.10 | [-0.04, 0.50] | 236 | 0.27 |
| Party ID: Independent | -0.25 | 0.67 | 0.71 | [-1.77, 1.26] | 11 | 0.01 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.23 | 0.18 | 0.20 | [-0.58, 0.12] | 196 | 0.22 |
| Race: White | 0.04 | 0.13 | 0.76 | [-0.22, 0.30] | 336 | 0.38 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.04 | 0.21 | 0.86 | [-0.46, 0.38] | 107 | 0.12 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.03 | 0.13 | 0.85 | [-0.29, 0.24] | 299 | 0.34 |
| Education: College | 0.22 | 0.24 | 0.36 | [-0.25, 0.70] | 88 | 0.10 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.08 | 0.30 | 0.79 | [-0.68, 0.52] | 56 | 0.06 |
| Gender: Male | -0.16 | 0.17 | 0.36 | [-0.49, 0.18] | 226 | 0.26 |
| Gender: Female | 0.17 | 0.15 | 0.24 | [-0.11, 0.46] | 217 | 0.24 |
| Ideology: Liberal | 0.34 | 0.20 | 0.09 | [-0.05, 0.74] | 122 | 0.14 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -0.06 | 0.17 | 0.74 | [-0.40, 0.29] | 152 | 0.17 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.07 | 0.20 | 0.74 | [-0.46, 0.33] | 169 | 0.19 |

| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|---------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.11 | 0.08 | 0.19 | [-0.26, 0.05] | 651 | 0.38 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.14 | 0.14 | 0.33 | [-0.14, 0.43] | 187 | 0.11 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.44 | 0.40 | 0.30 | [-0.41, 1.28] | 21 | 0.01 |
| Party ID: Democrat | -0.07 | 0.08 | 0.41 | [-0.23, 0.09] | 549 | 0.32 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.10 | 0.22 | 0.66 | [-0.35, 0.54] | 99 | 0.06 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.04 | 0.14 | 0.80 | [-0.24, 0.32] | 211 | 0.12 |
| Race: White | 0.03 | 0.08 | 0.75 | [-0.13, 0.18] | 653 | 0.38 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.22 | 0.13 | 0.10 | [-0.49, 0.04] | 206 | 0.12 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.04 | 0.10 | 0.65 | [-0.23, 0.15] | 467 | 0.27 |
| Education: College | -0.01 | 0.11 | 0.95 | [-0.23, 0.21] | 294 | 0.17 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.11 | 0.21 | 0.60 | [-0.52, 0.30] | 98 | 0.06 |
| Gender: Male | -0.12 | 0.10 | 0.23 | [-0.32, 0.08] | 448 | 0.26 |
| Gender: Female | 0.06 | 0.09 | 0.52 | [-0.12, 0.24] | 411 | 0.24 |
| Ideology: Liberal | -0.16 | 0.09 | 0.06 | [-0.33, 0.01] | 486 | 0.28 |
| Ideology: Moderate | 0.11 | 0.15 | 0.47 | [-0.19, 0.40] | 187 | 0.11 |
| Ideology: Conservative | 0.12 | 0.15 | 0.40 | [-0.17, 0.42] | 186 | 0.11 |

Table 23: Shafer (2017) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|----------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.25 | 0.12 | 0.03 | [-0.49, -0.02] | 294 | 0.17 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.06 | 0.15 | 0.69 | [-0.35, 0.23] | 346 | 0.20 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.08 | 0.15 | 0.61 | [-0.37, 0.22] | 230 | 0.13 |
| Party ID: Democrat | -0.16 | 0.12 | 0.18 | [-0.38, 0.07] | 457 | 0.26 |
| Party ID: Independent | -0.61 | 0.42 | 0.16 | [-1.48, 0.26] | 28 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.07 | 0.11 | 0.49 | [-0.29, 0.14] | 385 | 0.22 |
| Race: White | -0.17 | 0.08 | 0.04 | [-0.34, -0.01] | 648 | 0.37 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.07 | 0.18 | 0.69 | [-0.42, 0.28] | 222 | 0.13 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.07 | 0.09 | 0.44 | [-0.26, 0.11] | 622 | 0.36 |
| Education: College | -0.28 | 0.17 | 0.11 | [-0.62, 0.06] | 170 | 0.10 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.37 | 0.28 | 0.20 | [-0.93, 0.19] | 78 | 0.04 |
| Gender: Male | 0.01 | 0.12 | 0.96 | [-0.23, 0.25] | 426 | 0.24 |
| Gender: Female | -0.27 | 0.10 | 0.01 | [-0.48, -0.07] | 444 | 0.26 |
| Ideology: Liberal | -0.14 | 0.17 | 0.42 | [-0.47, 0.19] | 231 | 0.13 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -0.12 | 0.14 | 0.41 | [-0.39, 0.16] | 316 | 0.18 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.15 | 0.11 | 0.16 | [-0.37, 0.06] | 323 | 0.19 |
| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.05 | 0.06 | 0.41 | [-0.18, 0.07] | 649 | 0.39 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.02 | 0.14 | 0.91 | [-0.29, 0.26] | 159 | 0.09 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.34 | 0.32 | 0.30 | [-1.01, 0.32] | 32 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Democrat | -0.06 | 0.07 | 0.38 | [-0.21, 0.08] | 523 | 0.31 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.03 | 0.17 | 0.85 | [-0.30, 0.36] | 124 | 0.07 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.07 | 0.11 | 0.56 | [-0.29, 0.16] | 193 | 0.11 |
| Race: White | 0.01 | 0.07 | 0.83 | [-0.11, 0.14] | 637 | 0.38 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.26 | 0.13 | 0.04 | [-0.51, -0.01] | 203 | 0.12 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.05 | 0.08 | 0.57 | [-0.21, 0.11] | 457 | 0.27 |
| Education: College | -0.05 | 0.09 | 0.56 | [-0.23, 0.13] | 293 | 0.17 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.07 | 0.18 | 0.70 | [-0.42, 0.28] | 90 | 0.05 |
| Gender: Male | -0.01 | 0.08 | 0.92 | [-0.16, 0.14] | 431 | 0.26 |
| Gender: Female | -0.10 | 0.09 | 0.25 | [-0.28, 0.07] | 409 | 0.24 |
| Ideology: Liberal | -0.09 | 0.08 | 0.27 | [-0.24, 0.07] | 459 | 0.27 |
| Ideology: Moderate | 0.03 | 0.12 | 0.80 | [-0.21, 0.27] | 212 | 0.13 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.06 | 0.13 | 0.61 | [-0.31, 0.19] | 169 | 0.10 |

Table 24: Thompson and Schlehofer (2014) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|----------|------|------|---------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.02 | 0.20 | 0.91 | [-0.41, 0.37] | 124 | 0.15 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.23 | 0.20 | 0.24 | [-0.62, 0.16] | 153 | 0.19 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.06 | 0.22 | 0.78 | [-0.50, 0.38] | 123 | 0.15 |
| Party ID: Democrat | -0.08 | 0.17 | 0.65 | [-0.41, 0.26] | 208 | 0.26 |
| Party ID: Independent | -0.71 | 0.53 | 0.21 | [-1.90, 0.47] | 12 | 0.01 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.12 | 0.17 | 0.48 | [-0.46, 0.22] | 180 | 0.23 |
| Race: White | -0.07 | 0.13 | 0.58 | [-0.32, 0.18] | 304 | 0.38 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.21 | 0.25 | 0.40 | [-0.71, 0.29] | 96 | 0.12 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.07 | 0.15 | 0.64 | [-0.35, 0.22] | 269 | 0.34 |
| Education: College | -0.10 | 0.26 | 0.71 | [-0.60, 0.41] | 76 | 0.10 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.24 | 0.30 | 0.42 | [-0.83, 0.35] | 55 | 0.07 |
| Gender: Male | -0.07 | 0.17 | 0.70 | [-0.41, 0.28] | 205 | 0.26 |
| Gender: Female | -0.15 | 0.16 | 0.36 | [-0.46, 0.17] | 195 | 0.24 |
| Ideology: Liberal | 0.03 | 0.25 | 0.91 | [-0.46, 0.52] | 106 | 0.13 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -0.24 | 0.20 | 0.25 | [-0.64, 0.17] | 139 | 0.17 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.07 | 0.17 | 0.67 | [-0.40, 0.26] | 155 | 0.19 |

| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|---------------|------|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.05 | 0.06 | 0.39 | [-0.18, 0.07] | 991 | 0.37 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.00 | 0.12 | 0.99 | [-0.23, 0.23] | 288 | 0.11 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.33 | 0.24 | 0.17 | [-0.81, 0.15] | 66 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Democrat | -0.09 | 0.07 | 0.18 | [-0.23, 0.04] | 825 | 0.31 |
| Party ID: Independent | -0.11 | 0.14 | 0.43 | [-0.38, 0.17] | 182 | 0.07 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.03 | 0.11 | 0.76 | [-0.24, 0.18] | 338 | 0.13 |
| Race: White | -0.02 | 0.06 | 0.72 | [-0.14, 0.10] | 1040 | 0.39 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.14 | 0.12 | 0.24 | [-0.39, 0.10] | 305 | 0.11 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.03 | 0.08 | 0.69 | [-0.12, 0.18] | 711 | 0.26 |
| Education: College | -0.14 | 0.09 | 0.12 | [-0.32, 0.04] | 443 | 0.16 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.14 | 0.14 | 0.30 | [-0.42, 0.13] | 191 | 0.07 |
| Gender: Male | 0.03 | 0.08 | 0.70 | [-0.12, 0.19] | 608 | 0.23 |
| Gender: Female | -0.11 | 0.07 | 0.12 | [-0.26, 0.03] | 737 | 0.27 |
| Ideology: Liberal | -0.04 | 0.07 | 0.61 | [-0.18, 0.10] | 740 | 0.28 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -0.10 | 0.12 | 0.39 | [-0.33, 0.13] | 315 | 0.12 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.08 | 0.12 | 0.50 | [-0.31, 0.15] | 290 | 0.11 |

Table 25: Transue (2007) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | | N | Prop |
|-----------------------|-----------------|------|------|---------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.19 | 0.16 | 0.23 | [-0.12, 0.50] | 158 | 0.15 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.19 | 0.16 | 0.26 | [-0.14, 0.51] | 124 | 0.12 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.15 | 0.26 | 0.56 | [-0.37, 0.67] | 60 | 0.06 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.16 | 0.14 | 0.26 | [-0.12, 0.45] | 166 | 0.16 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.62 | 0.26 | 0.02 | [0.09, 1.15] | 49 | 0.05 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.02 | 0.18 | 0.93 | [-0.33, 0.36] | 127 | 0.12 |
| Race: White | 0.18 | 0.10 | 0.09 | [-0.03, 0.38] | 344 | 0.33 |
| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | | N | Prop |
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.08 | 0.11 | 0.50 | [-0.30, 0.15] | 252 | 0.23 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.08 | 0.19 | 0.68 | [-0.31, 0.47] | 89 | 0.08 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.50 | 0.45 | 0.28 | [-1.44, 0.43] | 23 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.09 | 0.11 | 0.43 | [-0.13, 0.31] | 199 | 0.18 |
| Party ID: Independent | -0.21 | 0.22 | 0.35 | [-0.66, 0.23] | 72 | 0.07 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.11 | 0.19 | 0.56 | [-0.48, 0.26] | 93 | 0.09 |
| Race: White | -0.08 | 0.10 | 0.43 | [-0.26, 0.11] | 366 | 0.33 |

Table 26: Turaga (2010) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|----------|------|------|---------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.12 | 0.20 | 0.57 | [-0.28, 0.51] | 156 | 0.16 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.01 | 0.18 | 0.96 | [-0.34, 0.36] | 190 | 0.19 |
| Age: More than 60 | 0.30 | 0.18 | 0.09 | [-0.05, 0.65] | 151 | 0.15 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.25 | 0.13 | 0.06 | [-0.01, 0.51] | 270 | 0.27 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.23 | 0.55 | 0.68 | [-0.90, 1.36] | 26 | 0.03 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.02 | 0.19 | 0.91 | [-0.36, 0.41] | 201 | 0.20 |
| Race: White | 0.10 | 0.13 | 0.44 | [-0.16, 0.36] | 378 | 0.38 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.16 | 0.19 | 0.40 | [-0.22, 0.54] | 119 | 0.12 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.11 | 0.13 | 0.39 | [-0.14, 0.37] | 358 | 0.36 |
| Education: College | -0.01 | 0.26 | 0.98 | [-0.52, 0.51] | 95 | 0.10 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.52 | 0.36 | 0.15 | [-0.20, 1.24] | 44 | 0.04 |
| Gender: Male | 0.16 | 0.15 | 0.28 | [-0.13, 0.46] | 244 | 0.25 |
| Gender: Female | 0.08 | 0.16 | 0.59 | [-0.23, 0.39] | 253 | 0.25 |
| Ideology: Liberal | 0.21 | 0.19 | 0.28 | [-0.17, 0.58] | 136 | 0.14 |
| Ideology: Moderate | 0.24 | 0.16 | 0.14 | [-0.08, 0.56] | 178 | 0.18 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.02 | 0.20 | 0.94 | [-0.42, 0.38] | 183 | 0.18 |

| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|---------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | 95% CI | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | 0.31 | 0.10 | 0.00 | [0.12, 0.51] | 519 | 0.38 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | 0.19 | 0.20 | 0.34 | [-0.21, 0.59] | 130 | 0.10 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.79 | 0.46 | 0.09 | [-1.72, 0.14] | 33 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Democrat | 0.30 | 0.11 | 0.01 | [0.08, 0.52] | 413 | 0.30 |
| Party ID: Independent | 0.31 | 0.26 | 0.23 | [-0.20, 0.82] | 92 | 0.07 |
| Party ID: Republican | 0.07 | 0.17 | 0.66 | [-0.26, 0.40] | 177 | 0.13 |
| Race: White | 0.22 | 0.10 | 0.02 | [0.03, 0.41] | 534 | 0.39 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.35 | 0.20 | 0.08 | [-0.04, 0.74] | 148 | 0.11 |
| Education: Less than College | 0.25 | 0.12 | 0.04 | [0.01, 0.49] | 346 | 0.25 |
| Education: College | 0.23 | 0.15 | 0.12 | [-0.06, 0.53] | 242 | 0.18 |
| Education: Graduate School | 0.27 | 0.26 | 0.29 | [-0.24, 0.78] | 94 | 0.07 |
| Gender: Male | 0.29 | 0.12 | 0.02 | [0.06, 0.53] | 312 | 0.23 |
| Gender: Female | 0.26 | 0.12 | 0.03 | [0.02, 0.50] | 370 | 0.27 |
| Ideology: Liberal | 0.35 | 0.12 | 0.00 | [0.12, 0.57] | 375 | 0.27 |
| Ideology: Moderate | 0.20 | 0.19 | 0.29 | [-0.18, 0.58] | 153 | 0.11 |
| Ideology: Conservative | 0.05 | 0.19 | 0.80 | [-0.32, 0.42] | 154 | 0.11 |

Table 27: Wallace (2011) Original and Replication Results

| Covariate Class | Original | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
|------------------------------|-----------------|------|------|----------------|-----|------|
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -0.49 | 0.18 | 0.01 | [-0.86, -0.13] | 139 | 0.15 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -0.76 | 0.15 | 0.00 | [-1.06, -0.46] | 181 | 0.19 |
| Age: More than 60 | -0.69 | 0.22 | 0.00 | [-1.11, -0.26] | 147 | 0.16 |
| Party ID: Democrat | -0.44 | 0.15 | 0.00 | [-0.73, -0.15] | 235 | 0.25 |
| Party ID: Independent | -0.30 | 0.25 | 0.26 | [-0.85, 0.25] | 14 | 0.01 |
| Party ID: Republican | -0.90 | 0.16 | 0.00 | [-1.20, -0.59] | 218 | 0.23 |
| Race: White | -0.99 | 0.12 | 0.00 | [-1.22, -0.77] | 354 | 0.38 |
| Race: Nonwhite | 0.14 | 0.18 | 0.46 | [-0.23, 0.50] | 113 | 0.12 |
| Education: Less than College | -0.67 | 0.13 | 0.00 | [-0.93, -0.42] | 317 | 0.34 |
| Education: College | -0.52 | 0.19 | 0.01 | [-0.90, -0.13] | 96 | 0.10 |
| Education: Graduate School | -0.75 | 0.28 | 0.01 | [-1.30, -0.19] | 54 | 0.06 |
| Gender: Male | -0.65 | 0.14 | 0.00 | [-0.92, -0.38] | 244 | 0.26 |
| Gender: Female | -0.63 | 0.16 | 0.00 | [-0.94, -0.32] | 223 | 0.24 |
| Ideology: Liberal | -0.45 | 0.23 | 0.05 | [-0.90, -0.01] | 108 | 0.12 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -0.74 | 0.16 | 0.00 | [-1.05, -0.43] | 179 | 0.19 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -0.63 | 0.18 | 0.00 | [-0.99, -0.27] | 180 | 0.19 |
| Covariate Class | Mechanical Turk | | | 95% CI | N | Prop |
| | CATE | SE | p | | | |
| Age: 18 - 39 | -1.14 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [-1.35, -0.92] | 340 | 0.37 |
| Age: 40 - 59 | -1.08 | 0.20 | 0.00 | [-1.48, -0.69] | 98 | 0.11 |
| Age: More than 60 | -1.21 | 0.63 | 0.08 | [-2.56, 0.15] | 16 | 0.02 |
| Party ID: Democrat | -1.14 | 0.12 | 0.00 | [-1.38, -0.89] | 277 | 0.31 |
| Party ID: Independent | -1.13 | 0.29 | 0.00 | [-1.71, -0.56] | 59 | 0.06 |
| Party ID: Republican | -1.06 | 0.17 | 0.00 | [-1.39, -0.72] | 118 | 0.13 |
| Race: White | -1.20 | 0.11 | 0.00 | [-1.41, -0.98] | 336 | 0.37 |
| Race: Nonwhite | -0.88 | 0.19 | 0.00 | [-1.25, -0.50] | 118 | 0.13 |
| Education: Less than College | -1.07 | 0.13 | 0.00 | [-1.32, -0.81] | 271 | 0.30 |
| Education: College | -1.15 | 0.16 | 0.00 | [-1.46, -0.84] | 146 | 0.16 |
| Education: Graduate School | -1.29 | 0.28 | 0.00 | [-1.85, -0.73] | 37 | 0.04 |
| Gender: Male | -1.29 | 0.14 | 0.00 | [-1.56, -1.02] | 224 | 0.25 |
| Gender: Female | -0.93 | 0.13 | 0.00 | [-1.19, -0.67] | 230 | 0.25 |
| Ideology: Liberal | -1.10 | 0.13 | 0.00 | [-1.36, -0.83] | 252 | 0.28 |
| Ideology: Moderate | -1.10 | 0.19 | 0.00 | [-1.48, -0.72] | 101 | 0.11 |
| Ideology: Conservative | -1.17 | 0.19 | 0.00 | [-1.55, -0.79] | 101 | 0.11 |

References

- Coppock, Alexander. 2018. "Generalizing from Survey Experiments Conducted on Mechanical Turk: A Replication Approach." *Political Science Research and Methods* .
- Mullinix, Kevin J., Thomas J. Leeper, James N. Druckman and Jeremy Freese. 2015. "The Generalizability of Survey Experiments." *Journal of Experimental Political Science* 2:109–138.